The Conflicts and Controversies Surrounding the Formation of Nicaragua's National Guard

Between 1927 and 1933, U.S. marines occupied Nicaragua and struggled to defeat the Guerilla Forces of General Augusto Sandino. They did so in conjunction with Nicaragua's newly created National Guard (*La Guardia Nacional*). However, as the US marines shaped the National Guard into a fighting force, policy makers engaged in a debate over the other roles that the National Guard would assume. Should its members include local police, educators, and judges in addition to soldiers? To what extent should U.S. marines control the National Guard? This debate is the subject of my thesis.

Nicaragua's National Guard was created as a stipulation of the Pact of Espino Negro, a peace treaty between the United States and Nicaraguan conservatives signed in 1927. The treaty's author, former Secretary of War and future Secretary of State, Henry L. Stimson included a number of provisions to temper the partisanship that had drawn Nicaragua into civil war. The creation of a U.S. trained and supervised National Guard, however, was chief among them. Stimson succeeded in persuading both the conservative president and the leading liberal general to sign the treaty, and for a fleeting moment, the turmoil in Nicaragua ceased. However, General Sandino, another liberal General, refused to recognize the US imposed treaty. He resolved to continue fighting a guerrilla war from the Segovias, a northern province abutting the Honduran border.

The previous scholarship has primarily focused on the role of Nicaragua's National Guard in quelling the Sandino rebellion[1]. However at the end of the U.S. occupation, the National Guard had became both the national military and the local police, it had established an education system for its recruits, and in some cases it had displaced local judiciaries. These aspects of the National Guard did not emerge on the battlefield but in the negotiations and contests involving Nicaragua and U.S actors. This is important because the role that the National Guard assumed in civil society greatly aided Somoza in his efforts to consolidate power. My thesis will study the voices of this debate in order to understand how they influenced the structure of the National Guard.

This thesis will explore the conflicting visions for Nicaragua's National Guard. I will examine the arguments of each contributor as well as the underlying experiences and beliefs that informed their positions. Between 1927 and 1929, American and Nicaraguan worked to compose a document outlining the responsibilities, budget for, enlistment methods, and training patterns of the National Guard. The Contributors included General Somoza, two Nicaraguan presidents, U.S. marines, and American diplomats. They disagreed over the consolidation of the local police and the national military under the National Guard and they quarreled over the methods of recruitment. The diverse backgrounds and

---

[1] Richard Millet, the only National Guard historian with published works, focuses on the struggle against Sandino in his book, *Guardians of the Dynasty* (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1977), and Michel Gobat comments on the imbalance of scholarship in *Confronting the American dream: Nicaragua under U.S. imperial rule* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2005), 217.

motivations of the participants shaped this debate and help to explain the degree of discord among them.

I will begin by contextualizing the debate within Nicaraguan and U.S. history. By 1927 the United States also had a long history of intervention in Nicaragua dating from filibuster William Walker's invasion in the 1850s. The United States intervened militarily in Nicaragua for the first time in 1912 and maintained a small contingent force there through 1933. This constant American presence in conjunction with deleterious economic policies had created strong anti-American sentiment by the 1920s. However since its independence from Spain in 1821, Nicaraguan politics had been marked by regionalism, and those in power relied on the official recognition and military support of the United States to hold their positions. The United States, on the other hand, desired stability in Nicaragua and hoped to shield the region from foreign competitors in order to protect American economic interests, but it also feared a long-term commitment of American personnel and resources to the region.

All of these elements contributed to the debate over the character of Nicaragua's National Guard. This thesis will trace the evolution of this debate over the course of 1927-1928. I will begin with Henry Stimson's vision of a constabulary force as articulated in the 1927 Espino Negro Pact. I will then examine the contributions of Nicaraguan Conservatives to the debate. What were their objectives? How did their contributions shape the National Guard? What were the most contentious issues between conservatives and U.S. officials? What factors characterized the debate between Nicaraguan liberals and conservatives? How did

the position of the liberals towards the National Guard change when they assumed power in 1929? What was the ultimate outcome of this debate?

Once I have examined the early evolution Nicaragua's National Guard, I will conclude by examining it as a facet of Somoza's rice to power. How did the debates over the formation of Nicaragua's National Guard contribute to Somoza's ability to consolidate his power? What were its enduring consequences?

Research Agenda:

My research will focus on primary sources located in the U.S. National Archives in College Park, Maryland. I will look at Record Group 59, file 817.1051, which is devoted to *La Guardia Nacional*, Record Group 59, file 817.00, which contains materials on political developments in Nicaragua during that period, and Record Group 127.8.2, which contains documents pertaining to the US marines in Nicaragua. In addition, I will make use of relevant published collections of materials, such as the *Foreign Relations of the United States* Series and the *Marine Corps Gazette*. I will conduct this research over the summer and visit the National Archives in August.

This thesis will also make use of Nicaraguan primary sources. Although most of the relevant Nicaraguan archival documents have been destroyed or are otherwise unavailable, some of the relevant materials that I will use include: *Etapas del Ejército*, a collection of pro-Guardia articles published by the Somoza government in 1940 and articles from *La Revista Conservadora del Pensamiento Centroamericano*, both of which are available through interlibrary loan.

Bibliography:

Archival Sources:

Washington, D.C., National Archives, General Records of the Department of State, 1
    763 - 2002, Record Group 59.

Washington, D.C., National Archives, Records of the U.S. Marine Corps, 1775 - 9999,
    Record Group 127.

Primary Sources:
Cox, Isaac Joslin. *Nicaragua and the United States, 1909-1927*. Boston: Peace
    Foundation Pamphlets, 1927.

Cramer, Floyd. *Our Neighbor Nicaragua*. New York: F. A. Stokes Co., 1929. Print.

Denny, Harold Norman. *Dollars for Bullets. The story of American rule in Nicaragua*
    New-York: Longmans Green, 1929.

Hall, Máximo. *Nicaragua y El Imperialismo Norteamericano; Contraste entre La
    Insolencia Norteamericana y La Vergonzosa Tolerancia de los Gobiernos de la
    América Latina.*. Buenos Aires: Artes y letras editorial, 1928.

Hill, Roscoe R. *Fiscal Intervention in Nicaragua.* . New York: Columbia University,
    1933.

Hopkins, J. A. H., and Melinda Alexander. *Machine-gun Diplomacy*. New York: Lewis
    Copeland Co, 1928.

"Marine Corps Gazette Archives | Marine Corps Gazette." *Marine Corps Association &
    Foundation*. N.p., n.d. Web. 5 Apr. 2012.
    <http://www.mca-marines.org/gazette/archives

Nogales, Rafael de. *The Looting of Nicaragua*. London: Wright & Brown, 1932.

Reyes Huete, A. *Etapas del Ajército*. Managua: Talleres Nacionales, 1940

Smith, Julian Constable. *A Review of the Organization and Operations of the Guardia
    Nacional de Nicaragua*. Quantico, Va.: Marine Corps School, 1937.

Stimson, Henry Lewis. *Henry L. Stimson's American policy in Nicaragua: The Lasting
    Legacy*. New York: Wiener, 1991.

U.S. Department of State. *Foreign Relations of the United States*. Washington, DC:

GPO, 1927-1933.

Use of the United States Navy in Nicaragua: Hearings before the United States Senate Committee on Foreign Relations, Seventieth Congress, first session, on Feb. 11, 18, 1928. Washington: U.S. G.P.O., 1928.

<u>Secondary Sources:</u>

Bickel, Keith B. *Mars Learning: the Marine Corps Development of Small Wars Doctrine, 1915-1940.* Boulder, Colo.: Westview Press, 2001.

Boot, Max. *The Savage Wars of Peace: Small Wars and the Rise of American Power.* New York: Basic Books, 2002.

Byrnes, Timothy A. *Reverse Mission: Transnational Religious Communities and the Making of US Foreign Policy.* Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press, 2011.

Chilcote, Ronald H. *Development in Theory and Practice: Latin American Perspectives.* Lanham, Md.: Rowman & Littlefield, 2003.

Clark, George B. *Battle History of the United States Marine Corps, 1775-1945.* Jefferson, N.C.: McFarland & Co., 2010.

Clark, George B. *With the Old Corps in Nicaragua.* Novato, CA: Presidio Press, 2001.

Cuadra, Pablo Antonio. *El Nicaragüense.* San José, Costa Rica: Libro Libre, 1987.

Daugherty, Leo J. *The Marine Corps and the State Department: Enduring Partners in United States Foreign Policy, 1798-2007.* Jefferson, N.C.: McFarland & Co., 2009.

Dodd, Thomas J. *Managing democracy in Central America: a case study : United States Election Supervision in Nicaragua, 1927-1933.* Coral Gables, FL.: North-South Center, University of Miami, 1992.

Evans, Stephen S. *U.S. Marines and Irregular Warfare, 1898-2007: anthology and selected bibliography.* Quantico, Va.: Marine Corps University, United States Marine Corps, 2008.

Gobat, Michel. *Confronting the American dream: Nicaragua under U.S. imperial rule.* Durham: Duke University Press, 2005.

Gravatt, Brent Leigh. *The Marines and the Guardia Nacional de Nicaragua 1927-1932.* Durham: Duke University, 1973.

Joes, Anthony James. *America and Guerrilla Warfare*. Lexington: University Press of
     Kentucky, 2000.

Joseph, G. M., Catherine LeGrand, and Ricardo Donato Salvatore. *Close Encounters of
     Empire: Writing the Cultural History of U.S.-Latin American Relations*. Durham,
     N.C.: Duke University Press, 1998.

Kamman, William. *A Search for Stability: United States Diplomacy toward Nicaragua,
     1925-1933*. Notre Dame, Indiana: University of Notre Dame Press, 1968.

Kimmens, Andrew C. *Nicaragua and the United States*. New York: H.W. Wilson, 1987.

Marston, Daniel. *Counterinsurgency in Modern Warfare*. Oxford: Osprey, 2008.

Millett, Richard. *Guardians of the Dynasty*. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1977.

Munro, Dana Gardner. *Intervention and Dollar Diplomacy in the Caribbean, 1900-
     1921*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1964.

Munro, Dana Gardner. *The United States and the Caribbean Republics, 1921-1933*.
     Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1974.

Rosenberg, Emily S. *Financial Missionaries to the World: The Politics and Culture of
     Dollar Diplomacy, 1900-1930*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press,
     1999.

Salisbury, Richard V. *Anti-imperialism and International Competition in Central
     America, 1920-1929*. Wilmington, Del.: SR Books, 1989.

Schoultz, Lars. *Beneath the United States: a History of U.S. Policy toward Latin
     America*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1998.

Solaún, Mauricio. *U.S. Intervention and Regime Change in Nicaragua*. Lincoln:
     University of Nebraska Press, 2005.

Tijerino, Frances. *Nicaragua en Vusca de su Identidad*. Managua: Instituto de Historia
     de Nicaragua, Universidad Centroamericana, 1995.

Tomán, René. *Wars of Latin America, 1899-1941*. Jefferson, N.C.: McFarland & Co.,
     2006.

Walker, Thomas W. *Nicaragua: Living in the Shadow of the Eagle*. 4th ed. Boulder,
     Colo.: Westview Press, 2003.

Weartmouth, John Milton. "The Second Marine Intervention in Nicaragua: 1927-1932." M.A. Thesis, Georgetown University, 1952.

Wiarda, Howard J., and Harvey F. Kline. *Latin American Politics and Development.* 2nd ed. Boulder, Colo.: Westview Press, 1985.

Zarate, Juan Carlos. *Forging Democracy: A Comparative Study of the Effects of U.S. Foreign Policy on Central American Democratization.* Lanham: University Press of America, 1994.

General Topic: A Political History of Social Change: Women in the Workplace in Modern Japan

In my thesis, I want to accomplish two main goals. The first is to examine the arena of social change in modern Japan, particularly, the groups that have attempted to initiate reform with regard to women's status in the workplace and those who have opposed the reforms (e.g. conservative politicians, businessmen), either by their active opposition or neutrality. In addition, I will examine the channels, either political, legal, or extrapolitical/legal, these groups have used in attempting to effect change. By analyzing the interaction among law, government, and women's movements, one can gain a better understanding of the social agenda of the Japanese government with regard to the progress and direction of change in women's status in the workplace and society. This analysis will also hopefully offer insight into the Japanese women's goals for changing their role and status in the workplace and society.

My second goal emerges from the particular vehicle I have chosen. I will analyze the congruence between the constitutional ideals established by the U.S. Occupation forces in the 1947 Constitution and the practices of the Japanese government, especially with regard to issues of gender and equality. To accomplish this goal, a time series analysis of Japanese women's struggle for equality in the workplace from the pre-war era through World War II and into the postwar era will yield a fuller understanding of the ideological and practical changes that have occurred in Japan with regard to the status of women in Japan, specifically in the workplace.

To accomplish these goals, the parameters of discussion must be mapped out and certain questions must be addressed. With regard to the politics of social change, one must address the question "How has social stability been maintained in modern Japan?" Many

historians argue that the prewar Japanese government utilized institutionalized coercion to suppress social movements and control the progress and direction of social change. With "democratic" principles imposed on the Japanese by the Occupation authorities and the Constitution of 1947, the government could no longer rely on institutionalized coercion to control social movements. With this new democratic structure of government, all groups, in theory, were allowed equal access to and participation in the political process. According to the theory and structure of democracy imposed on the Japanese government by the Occupation authorities, voices of dissent, utilizing their right of political participation, can challenge the status quo in a public forum. When this dissension is voiced, difficult issues can be raised at both the governmental and societal level. Raising awareness of these issues generates the potential for instability at the societal level, and yet despite the presence of this democratic theory and structure of government, voices of dissent and social instability have been noticeably absent in postwar Japanese history. Because social stability has been maintained in the Japanese society in the postwar era, a further question arises: "In practice, how effective has the Constitution of 1947 been in granting these social groups participation in the political process and what implications does this have for the Constitution's success in democratizing Japanese state and society?"

By studying the politics of social change in modern Japan, one can trace the progress and direction of change with regard to women, equality, and their status in the workplace. To measure the success of these social movements, I will undertake a study on a broad level, examining briefly the most visible changes at the societal level and then looking in more detail at specific industries and sectors of employment. I will examine the particular victories achieved and defeats suffered by women in their attempts to change their role and status in the workplace. (Success in this thesis will be defined as a movement toward equal opportunity and equal pay in job roles based on merit rather than gender. Statistics will be used to develop comparisons.) By focusing on the societal level, I will gain a broad understanding of the continuous and new themes emphasized by social movements in their

struggle to improve women's role in the workplace. At the societal level, I will look at the standard occupations held by women in the modern era and what progress they have made in improving their status in these occupations. I will research the new jobs women in modern Japan have entered and what factors (education, wartime conditions, growing egalitarian ideology, etc.) enabled them to enter these new fields. I will examine the role of the woman in the family and how this role may affect her role in the workplace. Finally, I will look at general laws (Occupation labor law changes, Equal Opportunity Bill, etc.) and see how these reforms have changed, if at all, the status of Japanese women in the workplace.

To understand in part the broad social changes that have occurred for women in the workplace in modern Japanese society, one must examine the changes that have occurred in the minds of Japanese women at the individual level. In many instances (though not all), for change to occur at the societal level, a consciousness and awareness of the need for change must be developed first at the individual level. To attempt to understand these changes, I will engage in a study of the literature, both non-fictional accounts and fictional narrative, by or about Japanese women. The subjects of these books will relate particularly (but not exclusively) to Japanese women and their roles in and attitudes toward the workplace.

This study at the societal level will be broken down into three distinct periods: the prewar, wartime and postwar eras. In the prewar era, as Sharon Sievers suggests, there was the beginning of a feminist consciousness in Japan. I will examine how widespread this feminist ideology was and if this ideology penetrated into the thoughts and actions of Japanese women in the workplace. I will look at the roles assumed by Japanese women in the workplace, whether that workplace be a cotton mill, silk spinning factory, or agricultural rice paddy/farm. Throughout my thesis, I must be careful to examine the thoughts and actions of not only feminist Japanese women but also the more typical women

in Japan. This process will allow me to see how extensively the ideal of an independent, strong-willed woman permeated the thoughts and actions of Japanese women.

One of the most crucial events to study in my thesis will be World War II and the Occupation. As Susan Pharr suggests, the U.S. Occupation was a time when the legal status of women in family, the workplace, and society was adjusted as a basic step in the goal of democratizing Japan and equalizing the status of all Japanese people. The equal status of women was important enough to the Occupation authorities that they wrote an "equal rights" clause into the Constitution of 1947. But as Thomas Havens suggests in his article, "Women and War in Japan," the actual experience of working women as well as the ideological foundation that determined their work roles during World War II was very much continuous with the prewar era. Although their jobs may have differed slightly, the ideology that underpinned the nature of their work grew out of the patriarchical ideology that girded the Japanese social structure in the prewar era. From this simple understanding, I am lead to view World War II as a continuity of experience and ideology for Japanese women in the workplace but a legal discontinuity because of Occupation reforms.

The discontinuity and continuity engendered by World War II makes a study of the postwar era a requirement for an understanding of the progress Japanese women have made in the workplace. A central question to be addressed is: Have the women in the postwar era used the legal power of the new Constitution to change their status in the workplace? If they have, has the practice of equality and experience of women in the workplace become more congruent with the goals of the Constitution of 1947? Has the ideogical foundation that determines women's role in the workplace begun to crumble? A series of related questions arise: Do the Japanese women's social movements limit their effectiveness when trying to initiate social change through the government? What other options do they have? Are groups more effective when trying to effect change at a more local level? Do the courts provide a viable option for social movements?

Much scholarship has been published describing the process and politics of social change in Japan, notably Pharr's recent study Losing Face: Status Politics in Modern Japan and Upham's Law and Social Change in Postwar Japan. Pharr's and Upham's studies of privatization of conflict are excellent examinations of a series of specific incidents relating to the process of social change and gender equality. From these incidents, Pharr and Upham reason deductively to arrive at a theory of the politics of social change. What is lacking in these studies is any systematic historical perspective on the long-term results and effectiveness of movements for social change. A time-series analysis of the progress made by Japanese women to improve their status in the workplace will allow me to examine the results of their struggle. Most of the scholarship that deals with Japanese women, the workplace, and their struggle for equality is segmented into three distinct areas (prewar, World War II, and postwar). Even though I will be synthesizing and analyzing scholarship from these three eras, I will not be creating three distinct and separate portraits in my thesis. Instead I will create a panoramic portrait that will display the continuous and discontinous trends charting the progress of Japanese women in the workplace. By creating this panoramic portrait, I can more easily determine whether the progress was the result of the conscious efforts of these social groups and/or exogenous factors that facilitated the struggle for equality.

The approach I will take is a multidisciplinary one, drawing on the fields of anthropology, sociology, political science, literature, and, of course, history. Sources will include a preponderance of secondary scholarship, both books and journal articles, various translated primary documents, newspaper articles relating to certain incidences of women's struggle for equality, as well as information solicited from interviews with Japanese women.

With regard to tentative conclusions, it would be presumptuous of me to venture any hypotheses, especially in this nascent stage of research. What I do hope to produce, time and sanity permitting, is an original and enjoyable piece of work that will expose me to a

thought process and research methodology more advanced than even what I have experienced in upper-level courses. I hope my rewards will be commensurate with my efforts and the finished thesis will be satisfactory to me, you, and the department.

Politics and Social Change

Apter, David E. and Nagayo Sawa. Against the State: Politics and Social Protest in Japan.
    Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1984.
Befu, Harumi. "Power in Exchange: Strategy of Control and Patterns of Compliance in
    Japan." *Asian Profile 2* (December 1974): 601-622.
Benjamin, Roger W. "Images of Conflict Resolution and Social Control: American and
    Japanese Attitudes Toward the Adversary System." *Journal of Conflict Resolution*
    19 (March 1975): 123-137.
Calder, Kent E. Crisis and Compensation: Public Policy and Political Stability in Japan,
    1949 - 1986. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1988.
Curtis, Gerald. The Japanese Way of Politics. New York: Columbia University Press,
    1988.
Flannagan, Scott and Richardson, Bradley. "Political Disaffection and Political Stability: A
    Comparison of Japanese and Western Findings." *Comparative Social Research*, ed.
    Richard Tommasson, Vol. 3.
    -Politics in Japan. Boston: Little, Brown, 1984.
    -"Changing Values in Advanced Industrial Societies: Inglehart's Silent Revolution
    from the Perspective of Japanese Findings." Comparative Political Studies
    14(January 1982): 403-444.
George, B. James. "Law in Modern Japan," Twelve Doors to Japan.
Haley, John O. "The Myth of the Reluctant Litigant." *The Journal of Japanese Studies*, 4
    (1978).
    -"Sheathing the Sword of Justice in Japan: An Essay on Law without Sanctions,"
    Journal of Japanese Sudies, 8 (1982)
    -"The Politics of Informal Justice: The Japanese Experience, 1922-1942." The
    Politics of Informal Justice, ed Richard Abel, vol. 2. New York, New York:
    Academic Press,   1982.
*Inukai, Michiko. "Agreeing To Differ: A Report to America." *Japan Quarterly* v. 13 no.
    2, April-June 1966, pp. 180-187.
Ishida, Takeshi. Japanese Political Culture: Change and Continuity. New Brunswick, New
    Jersey: Transaction Books, 1983.
Ishida, Takeshi, and Krauss, Ellis, eds. Democracy in Japan. Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania:
    Universdity of Pittsburgh Press, 1989.
Kabashami Ikuo and Jeffrey Broadbent. "Referent Pluralism: Mass Media and Politics in
    Japan." *Journal of Japanese Studies* 12, no.2 (Summer 1986), pp.329-362.
Krauss, Ellis S., Thomas P. Rohlen, and Patricia Steinhoff, eds. Conflict in Japan.
    Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1984.
Murakami Yasuske. "The Age of New Middle Mass Politics: The Case of Japan." *The
    Journal of Japanese Studies* 8, no.1 (Winter 1982), pp.29-72.
Najiota, Tetsuo, and J. Victor Koschmann, eds. Conflict in Modern Japananese History:
    The Neglected Tradition. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1982.
Nihonjin Kenkyukai, ed. Text of Seminar on Changing Values In Japan. Tokyo: Nihonjin
    Kenkyukai, 1977.
Notehefler, F.G. "Japan's First Pollution Incident." *Journal of Japanese Studies*, 1 (1975),
    pp.   351-383.
Oki, Masao. "Japanese Rights' Consciousness: The Nature of Japan's Judicial System."
    Look Japan, 10 January 1984.
Pharr, Susan. Losing Face: Status Politics in Modern Japan. Berkeley, California:
    University of   California Press, 1990.
    - Political Women in Japan. Berkeley, California: University of California Press,
    1981.
Sneider, David A. "Protest and Punishment in Prewar Japan: The Trials of the May 15th
    Incident of 1932." (Unpublished Paper, 1984, on file with author).

Tadashi Hanami. Labor Relations in Japan Today. Tokyo, kJapan: Kodansha International, 1979.

Takatabe Michitosi. "Mass Movements: Change and Diversity" In *Annals of the Japanese Political Science Association:1977: The Political Process in Modern Japan*, edited by Japanese Political Association, 323-359. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1979.

Upham, Frank. Law and Social Change in Postwar Japan. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1987.

White, James. "Civic Attitudes, Political Particpation, and System Stability in Japan." *Comparative Political Studies*, 14 October 1981, pp. 371 - 400.

Women and Societal Change

Atsumi, Ikuko. "Goals of Feminism in Modern Japan." Feminist International No. 2 Asian Women. Eds. Diane L. Simpson and Atsumi Ikkuo, 1980, p.96. (128)

Bando, Mariko Sngahara. The Women of Japan: Past and Present: About Japan Series 5. Tokyo: The Foreign Press Center, 1977.
- "When Women Change Jobs." *Japan Quarterly* v.33, no. 2, April-June 1986, pp.176-182.

Bamba, Tomoko, "The Office Ladies' Paradise: Inside and Out." Japan Quarterly, v.26, no. 2, April - June 1979, pp. 241-247.

Carter, Akiko. On Being a Woman in Japan. Tokyo: Femintern Press, 1975.

Fujieda, Mioko et al. Japanese Women Speak Out. Tokyo: White Paper on Sexism - Japan Task Force, 1975.

Fnjii, Harue. "Education For Women: The Personal and Social Damage of Anachronistic Policy." *Japan Quarterly* v.24, no. 3, July-September 1982, pp. 301-310.

Fuse, Akiko. "The Japanese Family in Transition: Parts I and II." The Japanese Foundation Newsletter v.12, no. 3, October 1984, pp. 1 - 11.

Hambata, Matthews. Crested Kimono: Power and Love in the Japanese Business Family.

Hoshino, Ai. "The Education of Women." Western Influences in Modern Japan: A Series of Papers on Cultural Relations. Ed. Inazo Nitobe. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1931.

Ide, Sachiko. "Language, Women, and Mass Media in Japan." *Feminist Japan* v.1, no. 4, February 1978, pp. 22-24.

Iijima, Aiko. "Where are We Headed? -- A Critical Analysis of Thirty Years of Women's Policy." *Feminist Japan* v.1, no. 4, February 1978, pp. 68-81.

Lebra, Takie Sugiyama. Japanese Women: Constraint and Fulfillment. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1984.
-"Sex Equality for Japanese Women." *Japan Interpreter* v.10, nos. 3-4, 1976, pp.284-295.

* Lippit, Noriko Mizuta. "Seito and the Literary Roots of Japanese Feminism."*International Journal of Women's Studies* v.2, no.2, 1979, p..155-163.

McClellan, Edward. Women in Crested Kimono.

Plath, David. Work and Lifecourse in Japan. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1983.
- Problems of Working Women. Tokyo: Japan Institute of Labor, 1986.

Robbins-Mowry, Dorothy. The Hidden Sun: Women of Modern Japan. Boulder, Colorado: University of Colorado Press, 1983.

*Sakanashi, Shio. "Women's Position and the Family System." *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* v.308, November 1956, pp.130-139.

* Sato, Kinko. "Working Women Pose No Threat." *Japan Echo* v.11, no.4, 1984, pp.50-54.

Takeda, Kiyoko (Cho). "Ichikawa Fusae: Pioneer for Women's Rights in Japan." *Japan Quarterly* v.31, no.4, October-December 1984, pp.410-415.

Tono, Harhui. "Industrialization in Japan and the Position of Women Workers: A Historical   Review." *Isis International Women's Journal* no.4, September 1985, pp.49-62.
   -Women in Japan: A Paradox of Modernization. Tokyo: Institute of International Relations for Advanced Studies on Peace and Development in Asia, Sophia University, 1979.

Yamada, Waka. The Social Status of Japanese Women. Tr. by Miya Sannomiya. Tokyo: Kokusai Bunka Shinokai, 1937.

Yoshiro, Kiyoko. "Interviews with Unmarried Women." Tr by Susan B. Murata. *Japan Quarterly* v.34, no.3, July-September 1987, pp.305-308.

Women and Individual Change

Hughes, Glenn. Three Women Poets of Modern Japan: A Book of Translations. Seattle, Washington: University of Washington, 1927.

Kawahara, Chizuko."Awakening of the Meiji Woman." *Asia Scene* v.7, no. 1, January 1962, pp.45-47.

Kobayashi, Fukuko. "Motherhood in Japan: Myth and Reality." *Feminist Japan* v.1, no.4, February 1978, pp.19-21.

Kondo, Dorrine K. Crafting Selves: Power, Gender, and Discourses of Identity in a Japanese Workplace. Chicago, Illinois: University of Chicago Press, 1990.

Kubota, Kyoko. "Alcoholism and the Housewife." *Japan Quarterly* v.33, no.1, January-April 1986, pp.54-58.

Mishima, Sumie. My Narrow Isle: The Story of a Modern Woman in Japan. New Yrok, New York: The John Day Company, 1941.

Muraoka, Hana. "The Tendencies in Current Japanese Fiction." *The Japanese Christian Quarterly* v.4, no.2, April 1929, pp.152-154.

Nakamoto, Hiroko. My Japan 1930-1951. New York, NY. McGraw-Hill, 1970.

Saisho, Yuriko. Women Executives in Japan: How I succeeded in Business in a Male-Dominated Society. Tr. by Roger Finch. Tokyo: Yuri, 1981.

Satomi, Myodo. Passionate Journey, The Spiritual Autobiography of Satomi Myodo. Tr by Sallie King. Boston: Shambhala, 1987.

Smith, Robert. Japanese Society: Tradition, Self, and the Social Order. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press, 1983.
   - The Women of Suye Mura. Chicago, Illinois: University of Chicago Press, 1982.

Takahashi, Sachiko. "Weary Wives--A Glance into Japanese Homes Through Wives of a Kingdom and Housewives Autumn." *AMPO* v.18, nos.2-3, 1986, pp.65-69.

Tanaka, Yukiko. To Live and To Write: Selections by Japanese Women Writers 1913-1938. Seattle, Washington: The Seal Press, 1987.

Tsurumi, Skazuko. Social Change and the Individual: Japan Before and After Defeat in World War II. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1970.

Wantabe, Kazuko. "Writings as Political Strategy: Asian Women's Writing." *Feminist Issues* v.6, Fall 1986, pp.41-52.

Prewar Japanese Women in the Workplace

Gordon, Andrew. The Evolution of Labor Relations in Japan: Heavy Industry, 1853-1955. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1985.

Ishihara, Kiyoko. "A Glimpse of the Working Population of Women." *Japanese Women* v.1, no.2, March 1938, pp.2-3.

Ishimoto, Barones Shidute. Facing Two Ways: The Story of My Life. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1984.

Kelly, William W. Deference and Defiance in Nineteenth Century Japan. Princeton:
        Princeton University Press, 1985.
*Kidd, Yasue Aoki. Women Workers in the Japanese Cotton Mills: 1880-1920. Ithica,
        NY: China-Japan Program, Cornell University, 1978.
Nuita, Yoko. "Fusae Ichikawa: Japanese Women Suffragist." *Frontiers* v.3, no.3, 1978,
        pp.58-62.
Ogata, Sadako. "Women's Participation in the Modernization of Japan." *StudiaDiplomatica*
        v.30,   no.3, 1977, pp.205-212.
Patrick, Hugh, ed. Japanese Industrialization and its Social Consequences. Berkeley,
        California: University of California Press, 1976.
Pharr, Susan. "Japan: Historical and Contemporary Perspectives." in Women: Roles and
        Status in Eight Countries. Eds. Janet Gele and Audrey Smock. New York,
        New York: John Wiley &   Sons, 1977.
Shibukawa, Hisako. "An Education for Making Good Wives and Wise Mothers."
        Education in   Japan: Journal for Overseas 1971, pp. 47-57.
Shimado, Noriko. "Ume Tsuda and Motoko Hani: Echoes of American Cultural Feminism
        in Japan." Remember the Ladies: New Perspectives on Women in American
        History. Ed Carol   George. Syracuse, NY: The Syracuse University Press,
        1975, pp.161-178.
Sievers, Sharon L. Flowers in Salt: The Beginnigs of Feminist Consciousness in MOdern
        Japan. Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, 1983.
Smith, Robert. "Japanese Village Women: Suye-Mura 1935-1936." *The Journal of
        Japanese Studies*, 7 (1981).
Tsuda, Ume. "The Future of Japanese Women." *The Far East* v.2, no.1, January 1897,
        pp.14-18.
        -"The Ideal of Womanhood as a Factor in Missionary Work. III. Japanese Women
        and the Problems of the Present day." *International Review of Missions* v.2, April
        1913, pp.291-   304.
Tsurumi, E Patricia. Factory Girls in Thread Mills.
        -"Feminism and Anarchism in Japan: Takamure Itsue, 1894-1964."*The Bulletin of
        Concerned Asian Scholars* v.17, no.2, April-June 1985, pp.2-19.
        - "Problem Consciousness and Modrn Japanese History: Female Textile
        Workers of   Meiji and Taisho."*The Bulletin of Concerned Asian Scholars* . v.18,
        no.4, October-December 1986, pp.41-48.
        -"Female Textile Workers and the Failure of Early Trade Unionism in Japan."
        History Workshop Journal, 1984 (18) : 2-27.
        -"Serving in Japan's Industrial Army: Female Textile Workers, 1868- 1930.
        Canadian Journal of History, 1988, Vol 23 (2): 155 -176.
Ushioda, Sharlie Conroy. "Women and War in Meiji Japan: The Case of Fukuda Hideko
        (1865-1927)." Peace and Change: A Journal of Peace Research, 4 (Fall 1977): 9-
        12.

Women, the Workplace, and World War II

*Havens, Thomas R. "War and Women in the Workplace, 1937 - 1945." *American
        Historical Review*, 1975 Vol 80(4): 913 - 934
Henderson, Dan. The Constitution of Japan.
Mishima, Sumie. The Broader Way: A Woman's Life in the New Japan. Westport,
        Connecticut: Greenwood Press, 1971.
Moore, Joe. Japanese Workers and the Struggle for Power, 1945-1947. Madison:
University of Wisconsin Press, 1983.
        -"Production Control: Worker's Control in Early Postwar Japan." *Bulletin of
        Concerned Asian Scholars* 17, no.4 (October-December 1985), pp.2-26.

*Nomura, Gail Meiko. "The Allied Occupation of Japan: Reform of Japanese Government Labor Policy on Women." Ph.D. dissertation, University of Hawaii, 1978.

Pharr, Susan. "The Politics of Women's Rights." In <u>Democratizing Japan: The Allied Occupation</u>, edited by Robert E. Ward and Sakamato Yoshikazu, 221-252. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1987.

Sano, Noriko. "Japanese Women's Movement's During World War II." Tr by Nancy Andrews. <u>Feminist International No. 2 Asian Women.</u> Eds, Diane Simpson and Atsumi Ikuko. 1980, pp.77-78.

*Soka Gakkai Women's Division Peace Committee. <u>Women Against War</u>. Tr by Richard Gage. Tokyo: Kodansha, 1986.

Postwar Japanese Women in the Workplace

Aoki, Michiko Y. and Dardess, Margaret. <u>As the Japanese See It: Past and Present.</u> Honolulu: The University Press of Hawaii, 1981. ("The Stories of My Life")

Asahi International Symposium. <u>Women in a Changing World.</u> Tokyo, Japan: Asahi Shimbum, 1985.

Brown, Catherine. "Japanese Approaches to Equal Rights For Women: The Legal Framework." *Law in Japan: An Annual*, 12 (1979).

Cole, Robert E. "Changing Labor Force Charcteristics and Their Impact on Japanese Industrial Relations." In <u>Japan: Paradox of Progress</u>, edited by Lewis Austin, 165-213. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1976.

Condon, Jane. <u>A Half-Step Behind: Japanese Women of the '80's.</u> New York, New York: Dodd, Mead, 1985.

Fujito, Kuniko "Gender, State, and Industrial Policy in Japan."*Women's Studies International Forum*, 1987,, Vol 10(6): 589-597

Goto, Aki. "Where are the Japanese Housewives Heading?" *Japan Echo* v.9, no. 4, 1982, pp.103-11.

*Haswega, Michiko. "Equal Opportunity Legislation Is Unneccessary." Japan Echo v.11, no. 4, 1984, pp. 55-58.
-"Equality of the Sexes Thretens Cultural Ecology." *Economic Eye* (June 1984) , 23-26.

* Hayashi, Hiriko and Alice H. Cook. <u>Working Women in Japan: Discrimination, Resistance, and Reform.</u> Ithica, New York: New York State School of Labor and Industrial Relations, Cornell University, 1980.

Hayashi, Yoko. "Myth and Reality: Institutional Reform for Women." *AMPO* v.18, nos. 2-3, 1986, pp. 18-23

Higuchi, Keiko. "Women at Home." *Japan Echo* v.12, no. 4, Winter 1985, pp. 51-57.
- "Japanese Women in Transition." *Japan Quarterly* v.29, no.3, July-September 1982, pp. 311-318.

Imamura, Anne E. <u>Urban Japanese Housewives: At Home and In Community.</u> Honolulu, Hawaii: University of Hawaii Press, 1987.

Kaji, Chizuko. "The Postwar Wife--No Longer Incompetent: Civil Code Revision and Equality for Women." <u>Japan Quarterly</u> v. 31, January-March 1984, pp.11-18.

Kaji, Etsuko. "Herded into the Labor Market." AMPO v.18, nos. 2-3, pp.34-41.
- "The Invisible Proletariat: Working Women in Japan." *AMPO* 18 (August 1973) : 48-58.

Kawashima, Yoko. "The Place and Role of Female Workers in the Japanese Labor Market." *Women's Studies International Forum* 1987 Vol 10(6): 599-611

Kimindo Kusaka. "Do Japanese Women Want Total Equality?" *Economic Eye* (June 1984).

Kitamura Hiroshi. "Viewpoints: The Working Woman's Rights." *Asia Week*, March 2, 1984, p.62.

Koyonna. The Changing Social Position of Women in Japan.

Matsui, Yayori. "Protest and the Japanese Women." Japan Quarterly v.22, no.1, January-
      March   1975, pp.32-39.

Muramatsu, Yasuko. Proceedings of the 1983 Tokyo Symposium on Women: Women and
      Work. Tokyo: International Group for the Study of Women; Kuala Lumpur: Asian
      and Pacific Development Center, 1983.

* Nakajima, Michiko. "Women at Work." *Japan Echo* v. XII, uo.4, Winter 1985, pp.58-
      65.

Noda, Machiko. "What Makes Wives Work?" *Japan Echo* v XII, no.4, 1985, Winter, pp.
      66-68.

Perry, Linda L. "Mothers, Wives, and Daughters in Osaka: Autonomy, Alliance, and
      Professionalism." Ph.D. Dissertation, University of Pittsburgh.

Pharr, Susan. "The Japanese Women: Evolving View of Life and Role." In Japan: The
      Paradox of Progress, edited by Lewis Austin, 301-327. New Haven: Yale
      University Press, 1976.

Shinotsuka, Eiko. "Women in the Labor Force." Economic Eye v.3, no.3, September
      1982, pp.22-26.

Shozawa, Miyoko. "View From the Bottom: Problems of Japan's Women Factory
      Workers."*The Japan Christian Quarterly*, v. 43, no.1, Winter 1977, pp.31-37.

Simpson, Diane and Atsumi Ikuko, eds. Feminist International No. 2 Asian Women.
      1980.

Smith, Robert. "Gender Inequality in Contemporary Japan." *Journal of Japanese Studies*
      1987 Vol 13(1): 1-25.

Sodei Takoko. "Family Stability in an Age of Working Women." *Japan Echo*, 9 (1980) 95-
      102.

Tadashi Hanami. "Equality and Prohibition of Discrimination of Employment-Japan."
      Bulletin of the Institute for Labor Elations (Bulletin 14), ed. R. Blanpain. Deventer,
      The Netherlands: Kluwer, 1985, pp. 159-172.

Takagi, Sumiko. "Women on the Labor Front." *AMPO* v.18, nos. 2-3, 1986, pp.48-54.

Takeneki, Chiharu. "Peace, Democracy, and Women in Postwar Japan." *Peace and
      Change* v.12, nos 3-4, 1987, p..69-77.

Ueno, Chizuko. "Genesis of the Urban Housewife." *Japan Quarterly* 1987 Vol 34 (2) :
      130-142.

White, Merry I and Barbara Molony, eds. Proceedings of the Tokyo Symposium on
      Women. Tokyo: International Group for the Study of Women, 1978.

Topic: "State-Sponsored Documentaries in 1950s India: Themes of Development through the lens of a Late-Colonial Cinematic Tradition"

John Grierson, a Scottish filmmaker who coined the term "documentary," summed up his views on the nature of film in a simple statement: "I look upon the cinema as a pulpit and use it as a propagandist..."[1] It was in line with this assertion that the Films Division of India (FDI), a government-sponsored producing and distributing unit focused on non-fiction cinema, was formed in December 1947,[2] less than four months after Indian independence. Over the next two decades, FDI produced more than 2700 films[3] out of which more than a third fell into the category of "educational, instructional and motivational" films in the FDI film catalog.[4]

This thesis will analyze the themes of development in selected films from this group, tracing the colonial origins of these themes in British films made in India during the last two decades of colonial administration. The thesis will assess the extent to which cinematic traditions introduced by the British influenced both the

---

[1] Giannetti, 318.
[2] Narwekar, 26. The unit was not formally named "The Films Division of India" until April 1948; between December 1947 and April 1948 it was formally known as the "Film Unit of the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting."
[3] Mohan, 6.
[4] Mohan, 26.

content of the FDI documentaries (models of development promoted by these films) and their form (cinematic techniques used to convey the messages about development to the audiences). This analysis of the convergences and divergences between late colonial and early postcolonial themes of development in Indian documentary film will rely on the economic and social history of India as well as the intellectual history of the idea of development.

The Context

Scholars who have studied Indian documentary film agree on the centrality of the themes of development in the early postcolonial period.[5] A key aspect in understanding the origins of these themes is the relationship between the Nehruvian postcolonial state and the medium of documentary film. In Srirupa Roy's interpretation, early postcolonial documentary became a tool used by the post-independence government to define the relationship between the dominating state and its "infantile" subjects:

> *[t]he participatory action envisioned by these films is sacrifice, restraint, renunciation… Individuals are 'motivated' to re-align their private values and actions with public or common ones, and to consequently redefine 'self-interest' in terms of the group rather than the individual self… To accept this narrative logic is to refrain from criticizing the failures, incompleteness, and exclusivity of the nation at the present moment: after all, we are still developing.[6]*

---

[5] These scholars include Srirupa Roy, B D Garga as well as Srivani Mulugundam and Vinod Pavarala.
[6] Roy, Moving Pictures, 246.

Roy's analysis of the role of documentaries in condoning the "state-nation" unity points to the crucial role of development themes in these films. Indeed, the use of documentary film in the process of development amounted to a pivotal issue for the Indian Ministry of Information and Broadcasting as much as twenty-five years after the founding of the FDI. On November 16-17, 1973, the Ministry organized a seminar on the "Role of Film in Development." Many of the speakers at the symposium recognized the potential of the cinematic medium to aid the process of development, calling for an even more extensive use of documentaries to reach wider audiences, especially in the far-flung rural areas.[7]

This tendency to highlight documentary film as a prominent element of the development toolbox in the postcolonial world was not unique to India. In 1971, UNESCO published a report with a title identical to that of the Indian symposium, arguing that the ability of the cinematic medium to "telescope time" is exactly what is needed in development, rendering documentary an exceptionally useful tool for a developing country government:

> *[Documentary film] can promote the circulation of knowledge both vertically across all social strata and horizontally across the length and breadth of countries, which lack an infrastructure of transport and communications. This very elementary and fundamental spread of knowledge and information is the essential basis for any development effort.[8]*

---

[7] Ministry of Information and Broadcasting, <u>Role of Film in Development</u>.
[8] Hopkinson, 11.

While the UNESCO report was intended for use by a wide range of developing country governments, the Indian case stands out for several reasons. Nehru's government had inherited an unusually developed infrastructure (film making equipment, projection halls, trained filmmakers) from the British colonial administration.[9] This made it possible for Nehru's government to harness film for its purposes shortly after independence. Furthermore, the government passed an act that effectively made it compulsory for cinema owners to screen at least 1000 feet (11 minutes for 35mm film at 24 frames per second) worth of government-made documentary films prior to each feature film.[10] The Indian case thus combines an exceptional potential to produce and distribute documentaries with a thrust of the government to seize this opportunity in a manner not unlike the compulsion exhibited in the use of film propaganda by Cold War belligerents.

And yet, despite the potential, the motivation of the government and the compulsion used in the process, many film critics and scholars have questioned the success of FDI's 'development-through-film' efforts. Many of the participants in the 1973 seminar—while acknowledging the potential of the cinematic medium to aid development—openly criticized the inadequacy of films produced by FDI during its first two decades. Sentences like "Documentary films were not well received by the people"[11] permeated the discussions at the seminar, with particularly strong criticism aimed at FDI's inability to seize rural audiences, the lack of feedback loops

---

[9] Mohan, Narwekar.
[10] Mohan.
[11] Ministry of Information and Broadcasting, Role of Film in Development, 10.

and impact evaluation mechanisms, excessive centralization as well as the prevalence of the "one-size-fits-all" approach in which "these films were meant for all people in the country. This sometimes resulted in communication to none in particular."[12]

This strongly centralized, state-focused approach of Nehru's government is symptomatic of what David Ludden has termed 'India's development regime.' Ludden argues that since "pre-colonial political culture produced multiple, overlapping levels and arenas of authority... pre-colonial traditions hardly sustain India's "stateness" and may better explain its opposition."[13] In his analysis, colonialism became the necessary bridge from pre-colonial decentralized government to the post-colonial centralization of state power. "In India, colonialism remains a constituent of a regime geared toward increasing state control over the terms of capitalist development, because colonialism makes the nation-state inherently progressive."[14] If the goal of FDI documentaries was to aid this progressiveness of the nation-state, did they also embed colonial cinematic traditions?

---

[12] Shri G. N. S. Raghavan's remarks in Ministry of Information and Broadcasting, Role of Film in Development, 13. The 1971 UNESCO report, which included case studies of several FDI-produced documentaries to illustrate the potential difficulties in utilizing the 'development-through-film' approach, aligns with many of these criticisms. The film *High-yielding Variety of Paddy*, an instructional documentary on the plantation and cultivation of high-yielding rice, for example, in many cases failed to communicate even the most basic concept of high-yielding grains according to the report (Hopkinson, 20-21).
[13] Ludden, 266.
[14] Ludden, 278.

The Central Issues

Integrating Roy's depiction of documentary film as a tool of Nehru's government to cement the unity of "state" with "nation" and Ludden's thesis of colonialism as a structural element of the Indian 'development regime' raises the question of continuity of the cinematic depiction of development from the colonial administration to the independent government. The questions this thesis will address are thus: To what extent do the FDI documentaries diverge/converge with the themes of development expressed the films made by the Brits in India during the last two decades of colonial administration? Are colonial notions of development embedded in Indian postcolonial documentaries? How do the filmmakers who made the FDI documentaries imagine their audiences? To whom do these documentaries attribute agency in the process of development—the state or its citizens? Are the themes of development expressed in these films compatible with India's postcolonial capitalist economy?

The answers to these questions not only have a profound impact on the assessment of the successes and failures of FDI's development-through-film approach, but also on the larger debate about the role of film in development. Was the perceived ineffectuality of these documentaries partially caused by the failure of FDI to critically examine the cinematic heritage of British colonial film and depart from its "orientalist" modes of representation? Or is the failure of FDI documentaries to substantially aid the process of development in postcolonial India symptomatic of a larger issue, possibly a problem with the very concept of development-through-film efforts? Although answering the question of whether this

limited success owes more to the inherent limitations of the development-through-film paradigm or its practical implementation by FDI in 1950s India is beyond the scope of this thesis, an analysis of the continuity of colonial cinematic traditions into postcolonial cinema proposed here would illuminate one of the factors involved in this question with implications to whether (how) documentary film should be used in the process of development.

Methodology

The key element of the research will be a fine-grained comparative analysis of development themes in FDI's 1950s documentaries stored at the FDI archives in Mumbai, India and late colonial films stored at the British Film Institute in London, UK. I intend to use secondary sources on the intellectual and economic history of Indian development in the late colonial and early postcolonial period (including work by David Ludden and Benjamin Zachariah) to develop categories along which I will compare the content of the two groups of films. These categories might include, for instance, the portrayal of economic planning, the role of education in development or the themes of agency in the process of development.

I will then integrate this comparative framework with elements of documentary film theory (including Bill Nichols' framework of modes of representation in documentary) and postcolonial theory (including Edward Said's 'Orientalism') with the aim of interrogating the form in addition to content. Nichols' modes of representation will help establish the relationship of the filmmakers to

7

their subjects: do the directors of these films try to stay detached from the issues and people portrayed by their films or do they choose a more participatory or even reflexive approach to their subjects? Do the modes of representation in the late colonial documentary films correspond to the modes of FDI's early documentaries? Edward Said's theory of 'Orientalism' will in turn help analyze the extent to which the 1950s documentaries continued in portraying India as an "other" in opposition to the "Occident." Did the films portray the Western world as a model of development to be followed by India or did it allow for any alternatives to this route, with a sensitivity to the specific needs of the Indian state's citizens?

Having developed this integrated cross-disciplinary theoretical framework, I will proceed to select the films to be analyzed. I intend to make use of the *Colonial Film: Moving Images of the British Empire* database, a recent joint project by a number of British universities and film archives that cataloged more than 6000 films and grouped them by themes, and the "Catalogue of the Films Division," a publication that lists all the films made by FDI. At this stage I intend to consult with both advisors about the number of films that I should analyze and the range of themes to be included in the thesis (is it feasible to apply all the axes of comparison to films focused on themes as diverse as economics, agriculture, education, family planning etc.?). Since I have already received formal research affiliation from The Institute for Social Sciences in Mumbai, I intend to apply for a research visa and spend three to four weeks in Mumbai and two weeks in London locating and analyzing the selected films.

Throughout the process I will be drawing upon the experience of my History FSP independent research project, my work with Professor Haynes as a presidential scholar, the courses I took as a part of my colonialism and development concentration as well as related courses I took in other departments (Film, Economics, Government). The Film and Animation courses as well as the experience of working on two documentary film projects during my time at Dartmouth provide me with an analytical toolbox suited for an in-depth analysis of documentary films. The History, Economics, Geography and Government classes on colonialism and international development I have taken during my time at Dartmouth complement this skill set with an exposure to a broad range of issues related to development. The research projects I was involved in (including my senior seminar paper on the attenuation of indigenous knowledge in the Philippines through American colonial education policy and a leave-term oral history project on the impact of colonialism on indigenous communities in the Marshall Islands) have provided me with the necessary experience to work with a wide variety of both primary and secondary sources in the specific context of a (post)colonial country. I believe these skills and experiences provide me with a firm footing for the in-depth research necessary for this project.

Funding

I am applying for History Department funding to cover the expenses related to the trip to the British Film Institute in London. A funding request with a budget is attached to this proposal. I am also applying for funding from the Undergraduate Research Office to cover the expenses connected with the trip to Mumbai.

Bibliography

Primary Sources

British late colonial films made in India in the 1930s and 1940s, BFI, London

Catalogue of the Films Division

Descriptive Memoir of the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting. Delhi: Government of India Press, 1956.

Films Division of India Documentaries made between 1950 and 1960, FDI archives, Mumbai.

Radio and Television: Report of the Committee on Broadcasting & Information Media. New Delhi, 1966.

Role of Film in Development: Report on a Seminar Organised by the Films Division, Ministry of Information and Broadcasting, New Delhi, November 16-17, 1973. New Delhi: Indian Institute of Mass Communication, Films Division, 1975.

Secondary Sources

Anderson, Benedict. Imagined communities. London: Verso, 2006.

Apffel-Marglin, Frédérique, and Stephen A. Marglin. Dominating knowledge: development, culture, and resistance. Oxford: Clarendon P, 1990.

Balakrishnan, Pulapre. "A Moribund Economy Quickened, 1950-64." Economic Growth in India: History and Prospect. New Delhi: Oxford UP, 2010.

Banks, Marcus. Using Visual Data in Qualitative Research. SAGE qualitative research kit. London: SAGE Publications, 2007.

Barnouw, Erik, and Subrahmanyam Krishnaswamy. Indian film. New York: Columbia UP, 1963.

Barnouw, Erik. Documentary: a history of the non-fiction film. New York: Oxford UP, 1993.

Bloom, Peter J. French colonial documentary: mythologies of humanitarianism. Minneapolis: Univ. of Minnesota P, 2008.

Burns, James M. D. Flickering Shadows: Cinema and Identity in Colonial Zimbabwe. Athens: Ohio University Press, 2002.

Chattopadhyay, Raghabendra. "The idea of planning in India, 1930-1951." Thesis. Australian National University, 1985.

Chowdhry, Prem. Colonial India and the Making of Empire Cinema: Image, Ideology and Identity. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2000.

Constantine, Stephen. The making of British colonial development policy: 1914-1940. London: Cass, 1984.

Dasgupta, Ajit Kumar. A history of Indian economic thought. London: Routledge, 1993.

Giannetti, Louis D. Understanding movies. Englewood Cliffs: Prentice Hall, 1990.

Foster, Gwendolyn A. Captive Bodies: Postcolonial Subjectivity in Cinema. SUNY series, cultural studies in cinema/video. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1999.

Garga, B D. From Raj to Swaraj: The Non Fiction Film in India. Delhi: Penguin India, 2008.

Hopkinson, Peter. The Role of Film in Development. Reports and Papers on Mass Communication no. 64. UNESCO, 1971.

Iyengar, Uma. The Oxford India Nehru Reader. New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2007.

Jag, Mohan. Documentary Films and National Awakening. New Delhi: Publications Division, Ministry of Information and Broadcasting, Govt. of India, 1990.

Jag, Mohan. Two Decades of the Films Division. Bombay: Films Division, Ministry of Information & Broadcasting, 1969.

Jaikumar, Priya. Cinema at the End of Empire: A Politics of Transition in Britain and India. Durham: Duke U.P, 2006.

Lee, J. M. Colonial development and good government: a study of the ideas expressed by the British official classes in planning decolonization 1939-1964,. Oxford: Clarendon P, 1967.

Leys, Colin. The rise and fall of development theory. London: James Currey, 1996.

Ludden, David. "India's Development Regime." Ed. Nicholas B. Dirks. *Colonialism and Culture*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan, 1992. 247-89.

Majeed, Javed. *Autobiography, Travel & Postnational Identity: Narratives of Selfhood in Gandhi, Nehru and Iqbal*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007.

Malhan, P N. Indian Films As Change Agents: A Hard Look. Mysore: University of Mysore, Dept of Post-Graduate Studies, 1970.

Melkote, Srinivas R. Communication for development in the Third World: theory and practice. New Delhi: Sage Publications, 1991.

Mitra, Ananda. India Through the Western Lens: Creating National Images in Film. New Delhi: Sage Publications, 1999.

Moraes, Frank. Jawaharlal Nehru: A Biography. Mumbai: Jaico Pub. House, 2007.

Mulugundam, Srivani, and Vinod Pavarala. "Narratives of development: A critical analysis of alternative documentaries in India." PhD. dissertation. University of Hyderabad, 2002.

Nair, K. S., and Shirley A. Smith. Perspectives on development communication. New Delhi: Sage Pubublications, 1993.

Narwekar, Sanjit. Films Division and the Indian Documentary. New Delhi: Publications Division, Ministry of Information and Broadcasting, Govt. of India, 1992.

Nichols, Bill. Introduction to documentary. Bloomington: Indiana UP, 2001.

Nichols, Bill. Representing reality: issues and concepts in documentary. Bloomington: Indiana UP, 1991.

Rehrauer, George. The Macmillan Film Bibliography. New York: Macmillan, 1982.

Renov, Michael. Theorizing documentary. New York: Routledge, 1993.

Roberge, Gaston. Communication, Cinema, Development: From Morosity to Hope. New Delhi: Manohar, 1998.

Roy, S. Beyond Belief: India and the Politics of Postcolonial Nationalism. Durham: Duke University Press, 2007.

Roy, S. "Moving Pictures: the Postcolonial State and Visual Representations of India." Contributions to Indian Sociology. 36 (2002): 233-264.

Said, Edward W. Orientalism. New York: Vintage Books, 2003.

Servaes, Jan. Communication for development and social change. New Delhi, India: Sage Publications, 2008.

Shohat, Ella, and Robert Stam. Unthinking Eurocentrism: Multiculturalism and the Media. London: Routledge, 1994.

Stollery, Martin. Alternative Empires: European Modernist Cinemas and the Cultures of Imperialism. Exeter studies in film history. Exeter: University of Exeter Press, 2000.

Swann, Paul. The British Documentary Film Movement, 1926-1946. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989.

The Impact of Film on Society. Madras: Centre for Social Research, 1974.

Thompson, Andrew. The Empire Strikes Back?: The Impact of Imperialism on Britain from the Mid-Nineteenth Century. Harlow: Pearson Longman, 2005.

Tomlinson, B. R. The political economy of the Raj, 1914-1947: the economics of decolonization in India. London: Macmillan P, 1979.

Vasudev, Aruna. Liberty and licence in the Indian cinema. New Delhi: Vikas, 1978.

Vasudevan, Ravi. Dislocations: The Cinematic Imagining of a New Society in 1950s India. New Delhi: Centre for Contemporary Studies, Nehru Memorial Museum and Library, 1994.

Woods, Philip. "From Shaw to Shantaram: the Film Advisory Board and the Making of British Propaganda Films in India, 1940-1943." *Historical Journal of Film, Radio and Television*. 21.3 (2001): 293-308.

Zachariah, Benjamin. Developing India: An Intellectual and Social History, c. 1930-50. New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2005.

The Development of Strategic Bombing Doctrine Between the Wars: A Comparative
Analysis of the Royal Air Force Staff College and the U.S. Air Corps Tactical School

Proposal

William "Billy" Mitchell, former World War I ace turned air power advocate,
wrote a 1921 book entitled, *Our Air Force: The Keystone of National Defense*. In it he
declared that air power would not only be used first in the next war, but that it would
"win the whole war."[1] Mitchell's bold assertions characterize the beliefs of a number of
airmen in the years immediately following the end of the World War I. With the
devastation of trench warfare still fixed in their minds, these men embraced a
fundamental doctrine that regarded aircraft as the dominant means of waging war in the
future.[2] The central tenet of this idea, what gave credence to Mitchell's claims, was the
belief that aircraft could fly over an enemy's armed forces, occupy a superior position in
the sky, and drop bombs onto the heart of the enemy. By doing so, the bomber could
force a nation to surrender without requiring the army to fire a shot. It was this powerful
concept that led many to overestimate the destructive capabilities of strategic bombing.
Indeed, a look at the Royal Air Force and the Army Air Force in World War II confirms
that both services had built an unrealistic doctrine of air warfare based upon their
confidence in the bomber.

In 1922, the influential British air power theorist, Sir Hugh Trenchard, founded
the RAF Staff College with the hope that the minds of the instructors and students would
"emanate new and brilliant ideas for the development of the Air and its power."[3] Two
years earlier, the Army Air Force had established a school at Langley Field with a similar
goal in mind. The school, known as the Air Corps Tactical School (ACTS), adopted the
motto, *Proficimus More Irretenti* (We Make Progress Unhindered by Custom). This
motto aptly characterized both the ACTS and its counterpart across the Atlantic.

Although the Royal Air Force and the U.S. Army Air Force shared a similar faith
in the bomber, the two services developed different doctrines for its employment. In the
early years of both schools, instructors and students studied the use of air power in World
War I. However, as ideas were refined and technology advanced, the schools began to
discount World War I as a valid historical precedent. For example, airmen at the Staff
College began to extensively revise the wartime RAF Operations Manual (C.D. 22).
Whereas C.D. 22 stated that morale was not an acceptable justification for attacking a
city, the commandant of the Staff College, Brooke-Popham, argued in 1926 that a
bomber is best used when "attacking targets as will most affect the enemy's will and
power to continue the war."[4] This subtle shift away from strict restrictions on bombing

---

[1] William Mitchell, *Our Air Force: The Keystone of National Defense* (New York: E.P.
Dutton & Company, 1921), xix.
[2] David MacIsaac, "Voices from the Central Blue: The Air Power Theorists," in *Makers of Modern
Strategy*, ed. Peter Paret (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1986), 629.
[3] Allan English, "The RAF Staff College and the Evolution of British Strategic Bombing Policy, 1922-
1929," *Journal of Strategic Studies*, Vol. 16 (September 1993), 409.
[4] Ibid., 414,

marks the early development of the British strategic bombing doctrine. In contrast, the airmen at the Air Corps Tactical School focused on the bomber's capability to disrupt industry. In the 1930s, the ideas of the RAF Staff College crystallized into a "vital target" doctrine and the ACTS formulated a doctrine based upon their "industrial web" theory. The differences between these two theories were revealed over the skies of Germany in the Second World War.

The air war in Germany also exposed the weaknesses of both bombing doctrines. Though a number of factors contribute to military doctrine, the RAF Staff College and ACTS occupied a unique and influential position in regards to the formulation of air power doctrine in the 1930s. My thesis seeks to explain how the two schools dealt with the powerful ideas circulating at the time about strategic bombing. How did the instructors and students develop an air power doctrine and why did the two schools produce such different strategies? How were the doctrines flawed and what were the origins of the flaws? By answering these questions, my thesis will assess the bombing campaigns of World War II with the ideas of the 1930s in mind. In doing so, I hope to show that the decisions made in World War II were directly rooted in the interwar conclusions made at the RAF Staff College and the ACTS. My thesis will demonstrate that success in war comes from effective peacetime decision-making.

Chapter Summary

Chapter I. Historiographical Survey

The enormous amount of writing that exists on the strategic bombing of World War II testifies to its ability to capture the historian's imagination. Given the interest in the events of the war, it is surprising to find a limited number of accounts that deal in depth with the ideas and influences on strategic bombing in the interwar period. And when it comes to studies on the Air Corps Tactical and the RAF Staff College, the list narrows to a handful of books and journal articles. In this chapter, I will examine the significant works regarding the Royal Air Force and the Army Air Force in the 1930s, paying particular attention to the several historians that concentrate on the two schools. I will also introduce the direction and originality of my thesis. This last characteristic lies in the fact that my paper takes a comparative approach to the development of strategic bombing in the 1930s and links it to the campaigns in both Europe and Japan.

Chapter 2. Background

World War I ended just as the British and Americans were beginning an ambitious bombing campaign. As a result, airmen from both countries returned home enthusiastic over the untested potential of air power. In this chapter, I will establish the basis for my comparison between the RAF Staff College and the ACTS. Both services not only shared confidence in the bomber, but also faced similar problems in the years after the war. For example, both services struggled for funding as the U.S. and Britain demobilized. However, during the 1920s the two services responded differently to these shared obstacles and began to develop contrasting ideas on strategic bombing. This

chapter will examine most of the 1920s and introduce to the reader issues such as inter-service rivalry, barriers to innovation, and the influence of Trenchard and Mitchell.

Chapter 3. RAF Staff College

In 1928, a new manual that incorporated the prevalent ideas of the Staff College replaced the Operations Manual (C.D. 22). Known as the RAF War Manual, its publication serves as a starting point for my examination of the Staff College. This chapter will rely heavily on archives of the Staff College at the RAF Museum. Following a short history of the Staff College in the 1930s, the chapter will move into an analytical analysis on how the bombing doctrine developed. The following questions will help shape this analysis. First, what did the independent status of the Royal Air Force mean for the level of debate at the Staff College? Also, how did the legacy of World War I influence faith in the bomber as a decisive offensive weapon? How were the ideas of the Staff College affected by the events in Europe during the 1930s? Finally, how did the Staff College respond to the Cabinet's 1938 decision to shift priority from bomber to fighter production?

Chapter 4. Air Corps Tactical School

In 1928, airmen at the Air Corps Tactical School were in the process of refining their views on the capabilities of the bomber. Two years earlier, instructors at the ACTS had written that "once airborne an air attack was virtually impossible to stop."[5] My study of the ACTS begins in 1928, as airmen continued to study the threat fighters posed to bombers. This chapter will draw heavily upon archives from the ACTS at Maxwell Air Force Base. The chapter will be similar in construction to chapter three; a brief history of the school in the 1930s will progress to an analysis on the development of bombing doctrine. Several questions will help frame this examination. How was debate at the ACTS affected by the fact that it was part of the U.S. Army? How did World War I and the Great Depression influence concepts such as the power of the offensive and the "industrial web" theory? How did the ACTS respond to events in Europe during the 1930s? Furthermore, how did ACTS develop the notion of the self-defending formations?

Chapter 5. Implications

On 14 February 1942, the British Air Ministry ordered the RAF to shift to nighttime area bombing against cities in the Ruhr Valley. In a matter of days, Sir Arthur Harris assumed command of Bomber Command and began to carry out the "vital target" doctrine that the Staff College had developed. Eventually, the British were joined by an American Eighth Air Force anxious to test out its "industrial web" doctrine. This last chapter will examine the British bombing campaign over Germany and the American campaigns over Germany and Japan. These campaigns will not be judged on their success (all failed to a certain degree). Rather, this chapter will show how and to what

---

[5] Robert Finney, *History of the Air Corps Tactical School* (Washington: Center for Air Force History, 1992), 64.

extent the prewar theories were linked to the air offensives of the Second World War. The nature of these links will be determined by the results of the archival research from chapters three and four.

Select Bibliography

Primary source documents from the RAF and the Army Air Force will be the central component of the thesis. Fortunately, a significant number of these documents still exist and are available to study. The RAF Staff College published an annual journal, *The Hawk*, which contained the best essays and lectures of the year. This journal is just one valuable piece in an extensive collection of Staff College documents held by the RAF Museum. The museum also owns the private papers of key theorists such as Trenchard and Staff College instructors such as Tedder. I am confident that any document I might need relating to the British experience in World War II can be found in the impressive collection at the Public Record Office. The documents of the Air Corps Tactical School are available at the Air Force Historical Research Agency on Maxwell Air Force Base. The Center also contains an assortment of manuals and handbooks that were written at the school and used for instruction through World War II. The private papers of prominent individuals involved in both the school and World War II are available at the Library of Congress.

1. Archives

Royal Air Force

British Public Record Office, Kew
    AIR 8: Air Ministry and Ministry of Defence: Department of the Chief of the Air Staff: Registered Files
    AIR 14: Air Ministry: Bomber Command: Registered Files
    AIR 20: Air Ministry, and Ministry of Defence: Air Historical Branch: Unregistered Papers

Royal Air Force Museum, Hendon
    Staff College Records
    Sir Arthur Harris Papers
    Sir Hugh Trenchard Papers
    Norman Bottomley Papers
    Arthur Tedder Papers

Library at Christ Church, Oxford
    Lord Peter Portal Papers

Army Air Force

Air Force Historical Research Agency of the United States Air Force, Air University, Maxwell Air Force Base, Ala.

Air Corps Tactical School Files
Army Air Forces Planning and Operational Records

Library of Congress, Manuscript Division, Washington D.C.
Papers of Henry H. Arnold
Papers of Ira C. Eaker
Papers of Curtis LeMay
Papers of Carl A. Spaatz

2. Contemporary Publications and Memoirs

Royal Air Force

Douhet, Giulio. *The Command of the Air*, New York: Coward-McCann, 1942.
Groves, P.R.C. *Our Future in the Air: A Survey of the Vital Question of British Air Power*. London: Hutchinson, 1922.
—. *Behind the Smoke Screen*. London: Faber and Faber, 1933.
Harris, Arthur. *Bomber Offensive*. London: Greenhill Books, 1947.
Kingston-McCloughry, E.J. *Winged Warfare*. London: Jonathan Cape, 1937.
Slessor, John Cotesworth. *The Central Blue; Recollections and Reflections*. London: Cassell, 1956.
Spaight, James. *Air Power and the Cities*. London: Longmans, Green, 1930.
—. *Air Power in the Next War*. London: Geoffrey Bles, 1938.
Squadron Leader. *Basic Principles of Air Warfare*. London: Gale and Polden, 1927.
Trenchard, Hugh. "Aspects of Service Aviation." *Army Quarterly*, Vol. 2 (April 1921): 10-21.
—. *Air Power: Three Papers*. London: Air Ministry, 1946.
Zuckerman, Solly. *From Apes to Warlords*. London: Hamish Hamilton, 1978.

Army Air Force

Arnold, H.H. and Ira Eaker. *Winged Warfare*. New York: Harper, 1941.
Gaston, James C. *Planning the American Air War: Four Men and Nine Days in 1941*. Washington, D.C.: National Defense University Press, 1982.
Golovin, N.N. *Air Strategy*. London: Gale & Polden, 1936.
Hansell, Haywood. *The Air Plan that Defeated Hitler*. Atlanta: Higgins-McArthur, 1972.
LeMay, Curtis and Kantor MacKinley. *Mission with LeMay*. Garden City: Doubleday, 1965.
Mitchell, William. *Our Air Force, The Keystone of National Defense*. New York: E.P. Dutton & Company, 1921
—. *Winged Defense*. New York: Putnam, 1925.
Seversky, Alexander. *Victory Through Air Power*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1942
Sherman, William. *Air Warfare*. New York: Ronald Press, 1926.
Wilson, Donald. "Origins of a Theory of Air Strategy." *Aerospace Historian*, Vol. 18 (Spring 1971): 19-25.

3. Secondary Sources

Royal Air Force Before World War II

Bialer, Uri. *The Shadow of the Bomber*. London: Royal Historical Society, 1980.

English, Allan. "The RAF Staff College and the Evolution of British Strategic Bombing Policy, 1922-1929." *Journal of Strategic Studies*, Vol. 16 (September 1993): 408-431.

Higham, Robert. *The Military Intellectuals in Britain, 1918-1939*. New Brunswick: Rutgers Univ. Press, 1966.

Hyde, Montgomery. *British Air Policy Between the Wars*. London: Heinemann, 1976.

James, John. *The Paladins: A Social History of the RAF*. London: MacDonald, 1990.

Jones, Neville. *The Origins of Strategic Bombing: A Study of the Development of British Air Strategic Thought and Practice up to 1918*. London: Kimber, 1973.

Meilinger, Phillip. "Trenchard and 'Morale Bombing': The Evolution of Royal Air Force Doctrine Before World War II." *The Journal of Military History*. Vol. 60 (April 1996): 243-270.

Millet, Allan and Murray Williamson. *Military Innovation in the Interwar Period*. New York: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1996.

Posen, Barry. *The Sources of Military Doctrine: France, Britain, and Germany Between the World Wars*. Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1984.

Powers, Barry. *Strategy Without Slide Rule*. London: Croom Helm, 1976.

Robertson, Scot. *The Development of RAF Bombing Doctrine, 1919-1939*. Westport: Praeger, 1995.

Smith, Malcom. "A Matter of Faith: British Strategic Air Doctrine Before 1939." *Journal of Contemporary History*, Vol. 15 (1980): 423-442.

—. *British Air Strategy Between the Wars*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1984.

Tress, Harvey. *British Strategic Bombing Policy Through 1940*. Lewiston: E. Mellen Press, 1988.

Army Air Force Before World War II

Finney, Robert. *History of the Air Corps Tactical School*. Washington: Center for Air Force History, 1992.

Futrell, Robert Frank. *Ideas, Concepts, Doctrine: Basic Thinking in the United States Air Force, 1907-1960*. Maxwell AFB, Ala.: Air University Press, 1989.

Greer, Thomas. *The Development of Air Doctrine in the Army Air Arm, 1917-1941*. Air Force Historical Study, 1955.

Holley, I.B. *Ideas and Weapons*. New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 1953.

Hurley, Alfred P. *Billy Mitchell: Crusader for Air Power*. New York: Franklin Watts, 1964.

Johnson, David. *Fast Tanks and Heavy Bombers*. Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1998.

Meilinger, Phillip, ed. *The Paths of Heaven: The Evolution of Airpower Theory*. Maxwell AFB, Ala.: Air University Press, 1997.

McFarland, Stephen. *America's Pursuit of Precision Bombing*. Washington: Smithsonian, 1995.

Watts, Barry. *The Foundation of U.S. Air Doctrine: The Problem of Friction in War*. Maxwell AFB, Ala.: Air University Press, 1984.

Royal Air Force in World War II

Allen, H.R. *The Legacy of Lord Trenchard*. London: Cassell, 1972.
British Bombing Survey Unit. *The Strategic Air War Against Germany, 1939-1945: Report of the British Bombing Survey Unit*. London: Frank Cass, 1998.
Garrett, Stephen. *Ethics and Airpower*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1993.
Hastings, Max. *Bomber Command*. London: Pan Books, 1999.
Messenger, Charles. *'Bomber' Harris and the Strategic Bombing Offensive, 1939-1945* London: Arms and Armour Press, 1984.
Pimlott, John. "The Theory and Practice of Strategic Bombing," eds. Colin McInnes and G.D. Sheffield. London: Unwin Hyman, 1988.
Richards, Denis. *Portal of Hungerford*. London: Heinemann, 1978.
Speer, Albert. *Inside the Third Reich*. London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1970.
Terraine, John. *The Right of the Line*. London: Wordsworth, 1998
Webster, Charles and Noble Frankland, *The Strategic Air Offensive Against Germany*. London: HMSO, 1961.

Army Air Force in World War II

Crane, Conrad. *Bombs, Cities, and Civilians*. Lawrence: Univ. Press of Kansas, 1993.
Craven, Wesley Frank and James Lea Cate, eds. *The Army Air Forces in World War II*. 7 vols. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1948-1953.
Dower, John. *War without Mercy*. New York: Pantheon, 1986.
Hallion, Richard. "Prelude to Armageddon." *Air Power History*, Vol. (Fall 1995): 38-54.
Pape, Robert. "Why Japan Surrendered." *International Security*, Vol.
Spector, Ronald. *Eagle Against the Sun*. New York: Vintage Books, 1985.
Thorne, Christopher. *Allies of a Kind: The United States, Britain, and the War against Japan*. New York: Oxford, 1978.
United States Strategic Bombing Survey. *The Effects of Strategic Bombing on the German War Economy*. Washington D.C.: Over-all Economic Effects Division, 1945.
United States Strategic Bombing Survey. *The Effects of Strategic Bombing on Japan's War Economy*. Washington, D. C.: Over-all Economic Effects Division, 1946
Werrell, Kenneth. *Blankets of Fire: U.S. Bombers Over Japan During World War II*. Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1996.

History Department Thesis Proposal

Waging Peace:

The Experiences and Lasting Impact of World War II Conscientious Objectors

Serving in New Hampshire's Civilian Public Service Camps

As World War II raged in Europe, Congress passed the Selective Training and Service Act, which established the first peacetime draft in US history. However, through the lobbying of historic peace churches, the Act included a provision to institute a Civilian Public Service program, which provided a middle course for the eventual 12,000 "limited cooperation" conscientious objectors, giving them an alternative to noncombatant military service and prison. Section 5(g) gave COs the opportunity to be "assigned to work of national importance under civilian direction."

CPS camps represented a joint endeavor of church and state, with the U.S. government providing camp facilities and projects while religious organizations (primarily Quakers and Mennonites) oversaw the camps' day-to-day activities. Projects included work in national forests, on farms, and in psychiatric wards. There were some 150 of the camps nationwide. New Hampshire was home to six CPS camps during the war; COs were stationed at the State Hospital in Concord working with mental patients, at U.S. Forest Service camps in Stoddard, West Campton, Gorham, and Warner, and at a dairy farm in Hillsboro County.

While the camps on the surface seemed a humane and improved method of handling the issue of conscientious objection, they masked severe underlying problems such as poor working conditions and dangerous medical experimentation. Among such experiments were starvation studies, in which COs' caloric intake was severely limited over the course of months, and hepatitis studies, in which subjects were injected with hepatitis and their condition monitored. COs in New Hampshire's CPS camps were infested with lice or bitten by malarial mosquitoes, and then given experimental treatments. These experiments are merely one part of the adversity that CPS workers endured, not to mention psychological hardships stemming in part from general public censure.

For this project, I plan to look at several aspects of the CPS work experience, using a close study of New Hampshire's CPS camps to illuminate larger truths about the CPS experience

nationally. I will look at the camps' punitive aspects, the interactions between COs and their surrounding communities, and issues of identity. Ultimately, my thesis will look at the lasting impact of the New Hampshire CPS experience on the communities surrounding the camps (including, in the case of the New Hampshire Hospital, on psychiatric care), on notions of experimentation ethics and human rights, and on the treatment of conscientious objectors in subsequent years. In this way, I hope to show how, in due course, this relatively small group of people in a minority peace movement was able to overcome considerable adversity and make an impact in their communities and in the peace movement.

To examine these issues, I will divide my thesis into the following parts.

First: Background on the CPS Program: This section will include relevant information about the treatment of WWI conscientious objectors nationally and in New Hampshire, as well as an explanation of how the CPS system was established, an overview of historic peace church resistance to the draft during WWII, and a description of the structure of the CPS camp system.

Second: Punitive aspects: In what respects were the CPS camps used to punish COs? What were the conditions of the New Hampshire camps? Did they have adequate food and medical care? The bulk of this section will deal with the human guinea pig experiments performed upon COs. What experiments were performed, and under what conditions? Why did the COs volunteer for experiments? Were they aware of the potential consequences? Did they feel pressure to undertake the experiments? How did those who carried out these experiments justify them? How do these experiments compare with those on African Americans in the South in the 1930s, on Jewish people in Germany during WWII, on American POWs in Japan, and on WWII veterans?

Third: Local communities' perceptions: What were the surrounding New Hampshire communities' perceptions of the COs who worked in the camps? Did they see them as traitors, cowards, unwelcome in their communities? Did they accept and appreciate their contributions to

their communities? Did the placement of these people in these camps, helping local communities, lead to the community members feeling any understanding and empathy for them?

Fourth: Issues of identity: How did all of these factors tie into the conscientious objector's sense of identity? Did the isolation, the lack of pay, the sense that these projects were not actually of "national importance," lead COs to desire to make sacrifices, and thus to accept more readily the punitive aspects of the camp (such as volunteering to participate in sometimes fatal human guinea pig experiments)? What toll did ideological conflict and demographic differences among COs take on their sense of solidarity and strength of purpose? How did community censure figure into the COs sense of identity, and what consequences did that have?

Fifth: Impact: These questions will focus on the effects that can be seen through examination of the New Hampshire camps. What was the lasting impact of the CPS camps on their local communities? What effects did the COs at the State Hospital have on psychiatric care? What role did the human guinea pig experiments play in the development of new attitudes towards experimentation ethics and human rights? How did the WWII CPS influence systems of dealing with and attitudes toward COs, during the Korean and Vietnam Wars? What about today?

Scholarly Significance

The significance of the CPS camps as a subject for research is clear; as Gordon Zahn, who was stationed at the Warner, New Hampshire camp stated, "Even the remote possibility that such a system might ever again be brought into being should be cause enough to explore the unhappy experience in some detail."[1] The CPS camps serve as an important example of minority groups seeking, through a partnership with the government, to devise a system to preserve their rights in wartime; an examination of the successes and failures of such a program, then, is essential to understanding how systems that protect wartime minority rights could be improved.

---

[1] Gordon Zahn, *Another Part of the War* (Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 1979), viii.

Very little has been written specifically about the New Hampshire CPS camps. Zahn's *Another Part of the War* is the sole secondary source that I have found about New Hampshire camps, and it deals almost exclusively with the Catholic CPS camp. Thus, there is much room for a study of the experiences of CPS workers in New Hampshire's camps, bringing together existing primary sources along with new oral history interviews.

Previous research has also largely passed over any comparisons that might be made between the experimentation on WWII COs and other historical examples of human guinea pig experiments, such as those listed above. These historical comparisons will be key to my analysis of the CPS, and they may develop into a still larger part of my thesis as my research continues.

Moreover, the bulk of previous scholarship has focused almost exclusively on the camp experiences themselves, within the context of WWII, with little analysis of the long-term historical impact of CPS camps. Zahn, for example, while he speaks briefly about the post-WWII influence of the CPS camp experience, focuses solely on the CPS impact on the Catholic peace movement. Compilations of oral histories -- such as Frazer and Sullivan's *We Have Just Begun to Not Fight* -- refrain from examination of the effect the CPS camps had on American culture and society, focusing instead on questions surrounding the WWII experiences of the CPS workers. My thesis will be unique among existing scholarship in its method of taking a small sample of the overall CPS system and exploring its effects in a variety of sectors such as medicine, human rights, and subsequent attitudes towards conscientious objection.

Methodology

My research will include my own oral history interviews with COs, their families, and community members, previously recorded oral histories, COs' correspondence and journals, camp newsletters produced by the CPS workers, community newspapers, camp administrative files, and other resources. I also plan to visit local historical societies learn from local historians.

For information on the punitive aspects of the camp, local community perceptions, and self-perceptions, I plan to conduct oral history interviews with surviving COs who worked at the camps. Although my access to such interviews is, of course, limited -- few WWII COs still survive -- I found, in my preliminary research, some names of surviving CPS workers, along with a number of already documented first-hand accounts that will be helpful in my project. The curator of the Swarthmore Peace Collection informed me that, in May of this year, a directory of WWII CPS workers will become available online with information as to who is still living and contact information. Arnie Alpert of the New Hampshire division of the American Friends Service Committee has given me several names of surviving CPS workers who would be willing to speak with me. There also are existing compilations of oral history interviews that will help me in my research. To find out more specifically about interactions between the communities and the CPS workers, I plan to look at local community newspapers from the time, and possibly to interview local people who were living in the communities during WWII. Correspondence, journals, and camp administrative files will also be helpful in learning more about these aspects of camp life.

The Swarthmore College Peace Collection contains a wealth of primary sources, among which are most of the American Friends Service Committee camp materials, in addition to the collected records of the Association of Catholic Conscientious Objectors. These materials include correspondence, journals, photographs, administrative records, and data on human guinea pig experiments. The Mennonite Central Committee's central office located in Akron, PA, has also provided me with a list of published and not published materials (also listed in the following bibliography) relating to CPS camps under MCC oversight that they would be willing to provide for my research. This summer, while I work at an internship in New York City, I plan to visit Swarthmore College and the MCC office, which are a couple of hours from where I'll be staying.

<div align="center">**Bibliography**</div>

Primary Sources

American Civil Liberties Union. 1940-1946. *National Committee on Conscientious Objectors Records.* Swarthmore College Peace Collection.

American Friends Service Committee. 1940-1947. *Records of the American Friends Service Committee: Civilian Public Service.* Swarthmore College Peace Collection.

American Friends Service Committee. 1945. *The Experience of the American Friends Service Committee in Civilian Public Service: Under the Selective Training & Service Act of 1940, 1941-1945.* Philadelphia: The Committee.

American Friends Service Committee. 1946. *Projects and Incentives: a Study of the Work Projects and the Incentives for Work in the Civilian Public Service Camps and Units Under the Administration of the American Friends Service Committee.* Philadelphia: American Friends Service Committee.

Civilian Public Service Union. 1944-1946. *Civilian Public Service Union Records.* Swarthmore College Peace Collection.

Federal Council of the Churches of Christ in America: Committee on the Conscientious Objector. 1941-1946. *Federal Council of the Churches of Christ in America: Committee on the Conscientious Objector Records.* Swarthmore College Peace Collection.

Frazer, Heather T., and John O'Sullivan. 1996. *We Have Just Begun to Not Fight: An Oral History of Conscientious Objectors in Civilian Public Service During World War II.* New York: Twayne Publishers.

LeDuc, Thomas H. 1940. *Collection of Published Materials on Conscientious Objection, 1940-1945.*

National Service Board for Religious Objectors. 1940-ongoing. *Center on Conscience and War Papers.* Swarthmore College Peace Collection.

National Service Board for Religious Objectors. 1947. *Directory of Civilian Public Service: May, 1941 to March, 1947.* Washington, D.C.: National Service Board for Religious Objectors.

Oral History Interviews with COs, their family members, community members (planned).

Personal papers of conscientious objectors in Civilian Public Service. (Too many to list.)

The Civilian Public Service Camp Newsletter Collection. Lewis & Clark College. Aubrey Watzek Library Archives & Special Collections. Portland, Oregon. (Includes Newsletter of Camp 84, New Hampshire State Hospital.)

War Resisters League. 1923-1994. *War Resisters League Records.* Swarthmore College Peace Collection.

Yoder, Anne M., comp. 2010. *Human Guinea Pigs in CPS Detached Service.* Swarthmore College Peace Collection.

Camp Newspapers

53. Camp #53. No. 1- No. 3 (Jan.-Apr. 1943). Gorham, NH. American Friends Service Committee.

84. Camp #84. Unnumbered (Dec. 1943). Concord, NH. Selective Service System/American Friends Service Committee.

Action, The C.P.S. Journal. Camp #32. Vol. 1, no. 1-no. 14 (March-June 1943). West Campton, NH. American Friends Service Committee.

Salt. Camp #15. Vol.1, no.1-no.2 (Jan.-Apr. 1942). Association of Catholic Conscientious Objectors.

Salt. Camp #54. Unnumbered (undated). Warner, NH. Association of Catholic Conscientious Objectors.

Secondary Sources

"Detour...Main Highway": Our CPS Stories. 1995. Goshen, IN. College Mennonite Church.

Anderson, Richard C. 1994. *Peace Was in their Hearts: Conscientious Objectors in World War II.*
    Watsonville, Calif: Correlan Publications.

Baumslag, Naomi. 2005. *Murderous Medicine: Nazi Doctors, Human Experimentation, and*
    Typhus. Westport, Conn: Praeger Publishers.

Bender, Harold Stauffer. 1942. *Mennonites and Their Heritage; A Series of Six Studies Designed*
    for Use in Civilian Public Service Camps. Akron, PA: Mennonite Central Committee.

Bennett, Scott H. 2003. "'Free American Political Prisoners': Pacifist Activism and Civil Liberties,
    1945-48". *Journal of Peace Research.* 40 (4): 413-433.

Dick, Robert T., ed. 1990. *Guinea Pigs for Peace: The Story of C.P.S. 115-R (1943-1946): The*
    University of Rochester Medical School at Strong Memorial Hospital, Rochester, NY.
    Windsor, VT: Annex Press.

Directory of Civilian Public Service [Revised 1996]. 1996. Washington, DC, National
    Interreligious Service Board for Conscientious Objectors.

Directory of Civilian Public Service, May 1941-March 1947 [Revised and updated through June
    1994]. 1994. Washington, DC, National Interreligious Service Board for Conscientious
    Objector.

Eisan, Leslie. 1948. *Pathways of Peace, a History of the Civilian Public Service Program,*
    Administered by the Brethren Service Committee. Elgin, Ill: Brethren Pub. House.

Fiftieth Anniversary - Reunion Akron Headquarters Staff of Civilian Public Service Years 1941 –
    1946. 1992. Not published.

Fiftieth Anniversary 1945-1996, CPS Unit #27, Mulberry & Barton, FL. 1996. Not published.

Gingerich, Melvin. 1949. *Service for Peace: A History of Mennonite Civilian Public Service.* Akron, PA: Mennonite Central Committee.

Gingerich, Melvin. 1949. *Service for Peace: a History of Mennonite Civilian Public Service.* Akron, PA: Mennonite Central Committee.

Glick, Lester J. 1997. *Civilian Public Service in Retrospect: Eighty-Six Men Recall Their Peace Witness in C.P.S. 1941-1946.* Not published.

Goossen, Rachel Waltner. 1997. *Women Against the Good War: Conscientious Objection and Gender on the American Home Front, 1941-1947.* Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.

Hein, Marvin. 1998. *A Community is Born: The Story of the Birth, Growth, Death and Legacy of Civilian Public Service Camp #138-1, Lincoln, Nebraska, 1944-1947.* Not published.

Heisey, M. J. 2003. *Peace and Persistence: Tracing the Brethren in Christ Peace Witness Through Three Generations.* Kent, Ohio: Kent State University Press.

Keim, Albert N. 1990. *The CPS Story: An Illustrated History of Civilian Public Service.* Intercourse, PA: Good Books.

Keim, Albert N. 1990. *The CPS Story: An Illustrated History of Civilian Public Service.* Intercourse, PA: Good Books.

Krehbiel, N.A. 2011. "Relief Efforts Denied: The Civilian Public Service Training Corps and the Starnes Amendment, 1942-43". *War & Society.* 30 (1): 48-60.

Landas, Marc. 2004. *The Fallen: A True Story of American POWs and Japanese Wartime Atrocities.* Hoboken, N.J.: Wiley.

Matthews, Mark. 2006. *Smoke Jumping on the Western Fire Line: Conscientious Objectors During World War II.* Norman: University of Oklahoma Press.

McNeal, Patricia. 1975. "Catholic Conscientious Objection During World War II." In *The Catholic Historical Review*.

Miller, Paul D. *The Farnhurst CPS Story*. Normal IL. Not published.

Mundell, Asa, ed. *Static Lines and Canopies: Stories from the Smoke Jumpers of 1943-1945 Civilian Service Camp 103, Missoula, Montana*. 1993. Beaverton, OR: Not published.

Nictigal, Wilbur. *The Civilian Public Service Years: 1942 – 1946*. Not published.

Our CPS Stories: Prairie Street Mennonite Church in Civilian Public Service, 1941-1946. 1996. Elkhart, IN: Prairie Street Mennonite Church.

Pasternak, Alfred. 2006. *Inhuman Research: Medical Experiments in German Concentration Camps*. Budapest: Akadémiai Kiadó.

Pearson GS. 1993. "Veterans at Risk: The Health Effects of Mustard Gas and Lewisite, edited by Constance M. Pechura and David P. Rall". *Nature*. 365 (6443).

Phifer, Gregg ed. *Smoke Jumper*. 1944. Missoula, MT: The Missoulian Publishing Company.

Regier, Austin, Susan Miller Balzer, and Raymond Regier. 2000. *The Courage of Conviction: The Correspondence of a Conscientious Objector*. North Newton, KS: Raymond Regier.

Robinson, Mitchell Lee. 1990. *Civilian Public Service During World War II: The Dilemmas of Conscience and Conscription in a Free Society*. Thesis (Ph. D.)--Cornell University.

Rohrer, Peter Lester & Rohrer, Mary E. *The Story of the Lancaster County Conference Mennonites in Civilian Public Service* (with directory). Not published.

Ropp, Herman E. 1995. *...By Reason of Religious Training and Belief*. Not Published.

Sareyan, Alex. 1994. *The Turning Point: How Persons of Conscience Brought About Major Change in the Care of America's Mentally Ill* . Scottdale, PA: Herald Press.

Sareyan, Alex. 1994. *The Turning Point: How Men of Conscience Brought About Major Change in the Care of America's Mentally Ill*. Washington, DC: American Psychiatric Press.

Schmidt, Ulf. 2008. *Karl Brandt: The Nazi Doctor: Medicine and Power in the Third Reich*. London: Hambledon Continuum.

Skloot, Rebecca. 2010. *The immortal life of Henrietta Lacks*. New York: Crown Publishers.

Swanson LE, and Gifford JF Jr. 1985. "Conscientious Objection and Clinical Care: A History of Civilian Public Service Camp No. 61 at Duke University, 1942-1946". *North Carolina Medical Journal*. 46 (7): 419-23.

Taylor, Steven J. 2009. *Acts of Conscience: World War II, Mental Institutions, and Religious Objectors*. Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press.

Tejada-Flores, Rick, Judith Ehrlich, and Edward Asner. 2000. *The Good War and Those Who Refused to Fight It*. Oley, PA: Bullfrog Films.

The Origins of Civilian Public Service. Washington, D.C.: National Service Board for Religious Objectors.

Wagler, David & Raber, Roman eds. and comp. *The Story of the Amish in Civilian Public Service*. Boonsboro, MD, CPS Camp No. 24. Not published.

Washington, Harriet A. 2006. *Medical Apartheid: The Dark History of Medical Experimentation on Black Americans from Colonial Times to the Present*. New York: Doubleday.

Wilhelm, Paul A. 1990. *Civilian Public Servants: A Report on 210 World War II Conscientious Objectors*. Washington, DC: National Interreligious Service Board for Conscientious Objectors.

Wittner, Lawrence S. 1969. *Rebels Against War; The American Peace Movement, 1941-1960*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Zahn, Gordon C. 1953. *A Descriptive Study of the Social Backgrounds of Conscientious Objectors in Civilian Public Service During World War II.* Washington: Catholic University of America Press.

Zahn, Gordon C. 1979. *Another Part of the War: The Camp Simon Story.* Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press.